

University Heights University Affairs Committee Working Session
Comments by John Carroll University
January 12, 2009
7:00pm

Good evening. Thank you Councilman Consolo and the members of the University Affairs Committee for scheduling this meeting tonight to address many of the questions, issues and concerns raised at the public meeting of the University Affairs Committee on December 4, 2008. This document will build upon the statement previously submitted by the University on December 29, 2008, which highlighted the request to install a playfield at Milford Rd. and changes to the use of Shula Stadium.

We also wanted to take this opportunity to state that this document has been reviewed and agreed to by Father Niehoff (and will have the action and support of the Board if and when it is needed).

Finally, we wanted to take this opportunity to briefly comment on some of the public statements made at the December 29th meeting. We wanted to take this opportunity to publicly thank all of the residents who attended the meeting and spoke about their concerns. A few themes that emerged included the following:

- Concerns regarding the time the sound system and lights are on in the stadium;
- Concerns with greenspace on Milford;
- Desire by the community to see JCU's comprehensive plan in an effort to be open and forthcoming; also a request to understand what we are planning to do with the homes the University currently owns.

With the emergence of these themes, I wanted to acknowledge that the University will continue to listen to members of Council and to our neighbors, and stands ready to work together with the city and its residents on finding some common ground related to the University's requests.

To follow, you will find the list of recommendations from the December 4 meeting of the University Affairs Council. The recommendation is listed in "bold" print, with John Carroll University's response listed below.

Recommendation A. The University Affairs Committee conduct a public meeting of all residents, with specific notice to the Milford/Warrensville Center neighbors, of the proposed demolition of JCU owned Milford houses and installation of playfield, as set forth in JCU Priority List Item 1, to be scheduled for Monday December 29 at 7:00pm in Council Chambers.

As was stated at the December 29th meeting, an additional playfield is needed near campus (we actually need three additional playfields near campus, but this issue addresses one of them). John Carroll University must create additional green space for varsity practices and intramural use. Currently, the stadium turf is overbooked during the hours of 3-7pm during the week in the academic year. Our immediate needs at this time are to create a green space on Milford for practice/intramural use. It is important to note here that we will also share the space with the

community and Gesu when it is not in use by the University. John Carroll's priority is to keep enrollment steady with a goal of increasing back to our peak enrollment in the late 90's, which was 4,250 undergrad and graduate students. In order to do this, we need to remain competitive academically and with our athletic offerings and install new playfields. Besides the added green space a playfield will provide to the area, we commit to the city government and its residents that if we create a playfield on Milford, that we will install it with amenities so that the value of the neighborhood remains high.

In the long term, we would hope to construct a playfield that spans from Milford to Warrensville Roads as more duplexes on Warrensville Road become available. Currently, however, we are only proposing to remove 5 homes on Milford (2614, 2602, 2596, 2590 and 2582 Milford) and one duplex that we own on Warrensville (2619 Warrensville), leaving the "buffer house."

Recommendation B. The University Affairs Committee conduct a public meeting of all residents, with specific notice to the Claver/Washington Blvd. neighbors, of the proposed expanded use of Shula Stadium, as set forth in JCU Priority List Item 5, to be scheduled for Monday December 29 at 7:00pm in Council Chambers.

At the December 29 meeting, John Carroll University requested the expanded use of Shula Stadium (lights, sounds-not decibel level but hours of use- and frequency of use) to accommodate student athletic and recreational needs. We asked that the University obtain use of stadium lights and sound systems from 8:00 a.m. – 11:00 p.m. for all fields for practice and intramural sports and increase the number of night games up to five per semester.

As was stated at that meeting, the sound level would not be increased, simply the use of the sound system would be allowed for a few additional hours each day. However, as was stated by many who attended the December 29th meeting, having lights and sound on until 11pm every evening might become problematic for some of our neighbors. The University is willing to talk about possible compromises to the time both the sound and lights are on, but the status quo is not an option – we simply need to be able to use our own university stadium longer than 9:00 p.m. In addition, per Item 10 of the original stadium document, we will commit to having the sound system checked and calibrated and can work with the Athletics Department regarding the adjustment of the sound level to ensure it is not increased above a level of 75 decibels. We will also commit to having a professional look at the lighting to ensure if shields should be installed.

Finally, with regard to items number 28, 30 and 31 we learned from the past Facilities Director that some research was done back when the Stadium was being built regarding that the sound wall was considered during the design process and was ruled out, perhaps at a council meeting, and a consultant recommended that a wall could actually make matters worse for the community and not better. Therefore, we would like to pull the minutes from this meeting to research what was said and decided upon. We would also be happy to discuss this matter with Claver Rd. residents.

Number 31 speaks of committing to publicizing a hotline (which will be our direct number for Campus Security-216-397-4600) for residents to call during all lighted nighttime stadium activities. We can immediately work with the City on publicizing this number.

Recommendation C. JCU specifically identify the houses it wishes to use as administrative offices/guest houses as set forth in JCU Priority List Item 9.

Discussion occurred at the December 4th meeting surrounding homes that would be used for administrative offices/guest houses. The committee requested that the exact location of these homes be identified. The addresses of the homes the University would like to use as guest homes or administrative offices include (see map for exact location):

- 4070 Carroll Blvd: This home would be used for our Department of Military Science.
- 2554 Miramar Blvd: This home would be used for Alumni Relations staff offices.
- 2568 Belvoir Blvd: Administrative staff offices or faculty/staff, family housing.
- 2574 Milford Rd.: Current “buffer” house- John Carroll owns this home, but we would not raze it to make room for a playfield. We would keep it for use as a family rental, administrative offices or a guest home for board members to use.
- 4174 Carroll Blvd.: Administrative offices or guest house
- 4202 Carroll Blvd: Administrative offices or guest house
- 2588 Belvoir Blvd: Administrative offices or guest house
- 2619 Warrensville Rd: This is the duplex we would like to demolish, but if the University Heights’ fire department would like to use the property for training drills before we take it down (as has been requested) we would agree with such a plan.

These homes are needed for offices and guest homes immediately. The university is also exploring moving some administrative positions off campus in order to accommodate our need for office space on campus.

Recommendation D. The requested re-zoning of the Green Rd. Annex, as set forth in JCU Priority List Item 4, be conducted in concert with the City’s discussions and studies on zoning throughout the whole City.

The University Relations Committee agreed that conversations surrounding the re-zoning of the Green Road Annex to U-5 be done in concert with a larger discussion on possible re-zoning for the entire city. John Carroll University would like to request that Green Road be rezoned immediately, and would like to discuss with council rezoning a playfield space on Milford as well.

Recommendation E (i). JCU be permitted to demolish Bohannon and install surface parking, as set forth in JCU Priority List Item 2(i).

John Carroll University is very appreciative of the Committee’s recommendation to allow the University to demolish Bohannon and install surface parking. The University would like to do this as soon as possible and move forward with establishing Hamlin Quad (please see Recommendation F).

Recommendation E (ii). With regard to the request for Administrative Drive gates at Miramar and Carroll, as set forth in JCU Priority List Item 2(ii), JCU provide the following further information: 1) a traffic study discussing the impact on pedestrians (especially neighborhood children) and increased traffic on Carroll; 2) identify the hours of operation for the gates; 3) a drawing of the proposed gates; 4) the reason for the need for such gates; 5) whether guardhouses would be built; and 6) the impact of the Carroll gate on real estate values in the area.

Per the discussion from the University Relations Committee minutes, JCU understands the concern surrounding the opening of the drive gates at Miramar and Carroll. Part of our rationale in opening these gates is to help direct visitors/prospective students and families to certain lots on our campus and to make finding designated parking lots and spaces less confusing. This was one of the recommendations from Sasaki and Associates as part of our campus master facilities planning process last year. We also intend to implement zoned parking internal to our campus. We also welcome Gesu's comments and input on this item and will schedule a conversation with them about this item. Allow us to provide some answers to the concerns raised here:

- Councilman Bullock's suggestion that a traffic study be prepared discussing impact on pedestrians and increased traffic on Carroll: JCU will work on completing a traffic study related to these concerns and would also be interested in coordinating a traffic study with Gesu Church and school. We will look at the possible increased traffic on both Carroll and Miramar and whether certain hours of operation (per Councilman Consolo's question) or if right or left hand-only turns would impact the safety to pedestrians and children in the area.
- Per Councilman Murphy and Goldberg's request, we have a map that highlights the location of the opened gates at Carroll and Miramar Roads. John Carroll University wants to open its campus to the community at these intersections in order to increase and enhance the appeal of campus to visitors/prospective students. By having these two access points opened, the University would obtain another entrance/egress point and the traffic flow surrounding the University will be improved. At this time, no guardhouses are planned. There is no intention at this point to close the North Park or Belvoir entrances to campus.
- Regarding a question pertaining to the impact of the Carroll gate on real estate values in the area, we believe that the traffic study's results will help illustrate this point.

Recommendation E (iii). With regard to the curb cut on Miramar near Washington Blvd, as set forth in JCU Priority List Item 2(iii), JCU provide the following further information: 1) exact location of the curb cut; 2) a drawing of the proposed entrance; and 3) the purpose for the entrance.

A curb cut is being requested at Miramar in order to help facilitate fire and safety as well as student moving days in the fall and spring. The exact location may be found on the

accompanying map of campus and would be finalized and discussed in conjunction with Gesu School.

Recommendation E (iv). With regard to the removal of boundary bushes, as set forth in JCU Priority List Item 2(iv), JCU provide the following further information: 1) location of the bushes to be removed.

JCU would like to remove the boundary bushes located on the highlighted areas of the map in order to open up the campus to the community and enhance the appearance of the University. As you might recall, it had been noted by Sasaki that John Carroll University has the appearance of “driving through parking lots.” If the bushes were to be removed, the University will commit to the city and its residents that we will not leave guardrails and parking areas exposed and commit to landscaping the area, but not with a planting of bushes similar to what currently exists. We have a vested interest in keeping our campus beautiful and attractive to students and parents.

Recommendation F. JCU be permitted to restore Hamlin Quad green space and remove the parking area as long as the number of new parking spaces at the Bohannon site is equalized.

A concern was expressed that if the Hamlin Quad is created and parking removed from this area, that parking should be equalized. The University would be compliant with the formula documented in 1258.04 of the U-5 code should the quad be created, with the rezoning of Green Road Annex as U-5. For more information on equalizing of parking, please see item H.

Recommendation G. The City transfer its ownership interest in the Bellefaire courts to JCU and facilitate an agreement between JCU and Bellefaire for JCU’s restoration and use of the courts.

Per the December 4 meeting, the city suggested it would transfer its ownership interest in the Bellefaire courts to John Carroll University and facilitate an agreement between the University and Bellefaire for the restoration and use of the courts. Since the December 4 meeting, Bellefaire wrote to the Mayor of University Heights and Council, stating that the lease between Bellefaire and the City had expired in 2003, and the land has since been returned to Bellefaire for Bellefaire to use as it desires. Learning this, the University will facilitate scheduling a meeting with Bellefaire in order to discuss possibly using these courts for varsity tennis matches.

Recommendation H. Explore the possibility and feasibility of the City and JCU partnering in a parking garage at the Bohannon site rather than surface/street parking.

For the record, the University is willing to take the suggestion of on-street parking off the table for reasons the city and its residents have voiced.

Regarding the possibility of constructing a parking garage, the difficulty is cost. Last estimates of a new garage were \$18+ million to construct below ground parking for 650 cars or \$6.5M to construct a 300 car above ground parking structure. Specifically, we found that underground

parking estimates were \$30,000 per stall. And a second estimate for an above ground 1000 car garage at Warrensville was \$20M (\$20,000 per stall).

In addition, Sasaki identified the Bohannon site as completing an Academic quad (Hamlin quad). It is unlikely that we would put a parking garage at the Bohannon site, but a temporary surface lot might be a possibility.

We are, however, open to discussions surrounding a garage construction partnership with the city in the future in a location that works for both of us. For immediate parking purposes, however, allow me to illustrate how John Carroll is in compliance with 1258.04 of the U-5 code.

1258.04 states: Parking shall be provided on off-street lots to the total sum of the following applied formula:

(a) the total number of students, full and part-time (**3,757**), divided by 4 students per parking space (**total = 939.25**), plus

(b) the total number of faculty (**213**), staff (**344**) and graduate students (**69**) [**sum is 626**] multiplied by a 90% attendance factor divided by 1.25 persons per parking space (**450**).

Total: $939 + 450 = 1,389$ spaces must be provided on campus. The University currently has a total of **1,867** spaces (1,645 spaces on campus with an additional 222 spaces at Green Road). Subtracting **250** spaces which would be eliminated from the creation of Hamlin Quad, the University would still have a total of 1,617 spaces (Green Rd. plus campus) and 1,395 on campus alone. Finally, the creation of a curb cut at Miramar would create 45 additional spaces (70 degree angled parking).

Discussion item #I: Renaming part of North Park Blvd to Carroll Blvd.

Although this item was not addressed at the December 4 meeting, the University would like to have continuity of “Carroll Blvd.” all the way to Fairmount Circle, primarily for branding purposes. The University would like to create a feel of entering a university campus through signage and street banners.

In summary, the University is appreciative of the meetings to date and of the ongoing discussion regarding our priorities. We are interested in hearing more from the residents and hope to work together to achieve our mutual goals.

A few remaining items on the list that we also wish to discuss include:

- Purchase of the **BP Station property** on Fairmont Circle for immediate economic development and/or additional green space use. The University respectfully asks that the City help research the owner of the property.
- **Build apartment-style residence halls** on or adjacent to the campus (likely discuss at a future date, as funds are not currently available).

- **Build a new aerobics (fitness) center on campus adjacent to the Lombardo Student Center** and adjust the south entrance of campus (as funds become available).
- **Close South Belvoir Blvd.** between Washington Blvd. and Carroll Blvd for safety. In the near term to better the safety issue, perhaps we could discuss installing a large speed bump in front of Campion and Hamlin.
- **Install a polling location on campus**, per the recommendation of the Cuyahoga County Board of Elections in August 2008. (They requested, and the University's agreed, that the Recplex or the Dolan Center for Science and Technology be designated a polling place. The request was denied by the current Mayor of University Heights. The Recplex was the one that was best to accommodate the on street campaigning that could not come on campus.

In conclusion, it was evident that the residents have a strong desire to “know our long-range plan” with the homes we own and in general, have a desire to understand our future plans. At this juncture, we can commit to communicating with the city and its residents our five year plan. In these difficult economic times, it is impossible to project what our plans are beyond five years. Given where the economy is right now we believe that anything beyond five year is unrealistic to predict. In an effort to be straightforward and honest, we can commit to you in writing that we will not place students in any of the homes we own in the Carroll/Kerwick neighborhood for the next five years (provided we get the support that we need from the city and our neighbors as requested) and commit to you that our desired growth boundary is as follows (see map).

Thank you for your time and attention this evening. We look forward to working with you.

Original Stadium Document:

On September 23, 2002 University Heights City Council approved the September 9, 2002 recommendation of the Planning Commission with respect to John Carroll University's construction of the Don Shula Stadium, with the following thirty-two (32) conditions, as amended:

~~(1) Construction roads (main one off S. Belvoir Blvd. and secondary access road off Washington Blvd.) and all truck traffic and other traffic flow to meet the approval of the Chief of Police. All construction shall be staged, including materials and vehicles, on John Carroll University property.~~

~~(2) Flag men are to be provided as needed as established by the Chief of Police.~~

~~(3) Dust must be controlled at construction site and on construction roads, including keeping city streets clean and using washing stations for trucks and other equipment.~~

~~(4) Truck traffic to the site off of S. Belvoir Blvd. to come in from main roads such as Fairmount Blvd. and Green Road.~~

~~(5) Access for fire and rescue equipment is to be approved by Chief of Fire.~~

~~(6) Permanent location of the generator will be on the west side of stadium between Hamlin Hall and the stadium.~~

(7) Intramural sports and club sports practices with no competition against outside teams may be held in the evening from Monday - Thursday nights from September 1 thru November 15 and March 1 thru May 15. All intramural activities must be concluded with the light system turned off no later than 9:00 p.m.

John Carroll University would like to amend this language to allow lights and sound at Shula Stadium to be from 8:00am-11:00pm. There are no plans to have lights or sound on Milford playfields at this time.

(8) The new Stadium shall be utilized by John Carroll University only, with the exception of high school practices during the daytime only.

The University would like to amend this language to state that the University be allowed to schedule 10 events in the stadium per academic year (5 night games per semester) without prior approval of the city. Of course, please note, we will absolutely notify the city when events are scheduled. By allowing more flexibility to schedule events in the stadium, John Carroll University gains exposure, which could have a direct impact on enrollment. By allowing added flexibility to schedule events without having to go through an "approval" process, we will not miss the opportunity to host events. Some examples of lost events (lost exposure and lost revenue to the city) are as follows:

- 2 games of High School Lacrosse
- Track Meet
- High school men's/women's soccer games
- 2 High School football games

There is also a significant upside to the city in allowing the University to more freely schedule events: the city will enjoy people from other areas of the region/state coming to University Heights and utilizing its restaurants and retail stores.

John Carroll University would also like to submit that we would be willing to look into reasons why we use a private ambulance service and not our UH EMS services during our sporting events.

Finally, we will give consideration in scheduling Friday night and Saturday day games beyond regularly scheduled varsity games (in consideration of the Jewish Sabbath).

(9) There shall be no more than one night varsity football game a year with no more than two night varsity football games in a year when Mt. Union plays John Carroll University at John Carroll University, and no more than two night soccer varsity games a year each for women and

men; lights and sound systems shall be turned off at 10:00 p.m. for all night games unless football goes into overtime. All night games will start no later than 7:00 p.m. so that they can end as early as possible, but no later than 10 p.m. with the exception of overtime for football and soccer. Without exception, John Carroll University shall not discharge a cannon or other similar devices during night varsity football games.

According to this original language, the total night games allowed are as follows:

- Maximum of 2 when JCU plays Mount Union at home
- Maximum of 2 soccer games each for men and women (4 games total)

John Carroll University would like to, as stated above, allow 5 night events per semester, without specifically stating the type of event (football/soccer/outside event, etc).

(10) The speaker system and bands will not be used for intramural games. New sound system to be installed for football games will be designed so that the sound is concentrated solely on the seating areas and will not “wash” to the back and sides of the seating areas. The maximum sound level not to exceed 75db at the lot line as presented by Paladin Professional Sound. Sound level for soccer games to be no more than between 58 and 64db. The sound level to be pre-set, locked in at installation based on sound level meter reading at the property line. Sound system to be focused to address noise levels.

John Carroll University is requesting that we are allowed the use of our sound system from 8am-11pm daily. We will commit to not increasing the decibel level and commit to inspecting the system so that the sound is directed toward the field and not the community.

~~(11) The sewer system is not to be adversely affected by additional toilet facilities required by State Code and must be approved by the City Engineer.~~

~~(12) John Carroll University agrees not to submit an application for expansion of the use of the football stadium for at least 5 years from the date of Council approval of the preliminary plan for Don Shula Stadium.~~

~~(13) The transformer replacement to remain in current location and enough power must be provided by The Illuminating Company so there are no brown outs or outages in surrounding neighborhoods.~~

(14) The stadium shall not be used for concerts at any time and any other noise generating events at night not approved with this motion; also, the Police Department shall be kept informed of all scheduled events.

John Carroll University commits to not using the stadium for concerts. However, we ask that we are permitted the expanded use of the stadium for 5 night events per semester per what was previously stated above (see number 8).

(15) Shuttle bus service is to be provided for overflow crowds from University Square parking garage, terms to be arranged for between John Carroll University and

University Square Developers, Starwood Wasserman. Plans for the parking to be made well in advance of events and the Police Department shall be notified of any changes to the above parking plan. John Carroll University shall submit to the City a varsity football parking plan by August 1st of each year to be approved by the Chief of Police.

Shuttle bus service is not needed; we have found that for any varsity game, our other lots are empty, so parking is not an issue.

~~(16) Night lighting to be provided by 75 foot candles for varsity football games and 30 foot candles for intramurals; with the ability to switch between 75 foot candles and 30 foot candles.~~

~~(17) A 40 ft. variance request shall be referred to the Board of Zoning Appeals for the height of the stadium lights if 100' high poles are used. (if lower poles are used the 40 ft. variance will still apply).~~

~~(18) The stadium light poles shall not exceed a maximum height of 100 ft. and cannot be used for any purpose whatsoever other than lighting the stadium.~~

~~(19) A 7 ft. variance shall be referred to Board of Zoning Appeals for the height of the stadium.~~

(20) If future lights are to be considered for the baseball fields and tennis courts, then John Carroll University must come back to Planning Commission for approval prior to installation. John Carroll University agrees not to submit a plan for lighting of the baseball fields for at least five (5) years from Council approval of the preliminary plans for the Don Shula Stadium.

John Carroll University is comfortable keeping this language intact.

~~(21) The lights for the football field must be designed by Musco Lighting with Level 8 Total Light Control System with glow control, light shields, a top visor, and inner visors to control light spills, all as per the demonstration film, the testimony heard, and the demonstration at Rowland Field in Lyndhurst.~~

~~(22) A new gas line to be installed under So. Belvoir Blvd. must be bored under the roadway in lieu of excavating the street, subject to review and approval by the City Engineer.~~

~~(23) Cleveland Water Department must approve water line connection in tree lawn of Washington Blvd.~~

~~(24) Site Photometric Study must be reviewed and approved by the City Engineer.~~

(25) The project must have a fire suppression plan approved by the Building

~~Commissioner such as but not limited to, a wet system for lower level and a dry system fed by a fire main at a vault on Washington Blvd. for the upper levels.~~

~~(26) Trash enclosure to be relocated behind Campion Hall.~~

~~(27) The project shall meet the approval of each department of the City: Building, Engineering, Fire, Police, and Service.~~

(28) A sound wall/fence plus mounding with additional landscaping shall be placed on east end of the John Carroll University property backing onto the Claver Road properties. The sound wall or fence shall be 8' high and must be approved by the Building Commissioner, City Engineer and Architectural Review Board prior to installation. Such approval must be predicated on sound reduction, aesthetic, and storm water run-off considerations. John Carroll University shall maintain whatever is constructed, wall/fence and mound. Variance request of 2 ft. for sound wall/fence shall be referred to the Board of Zoning Appeals. Further, John Carroll University agrees to monitor water spill off and/or drainage flowing towards the residential neighborhood from the stadium. Consultation with neighbors on type of fencing, subsequent construction of fencing, landscaping and landscape installation will occur before the facility will be put in use.

We will consider looking into this and will confer with Claver Rd. residents.

~~(29) Additional trees or landscaping to be provided by John Carroll University on the Washington Blvd. side of fields and stadium to further reduce noise in that area.~~

(30) No changes shall be made in the use of the stadium without prior approval of the City of University Heights.

Again, per item number 8, the University requests that this language is amended.

(31) A hotline shall be made available to residents by John Carroll University during business hours beginning with commencement of construction of Don Shula Stadium and subsequently staffed by John Carroll University during all lighted nighttime stadium activities.

Our main number will provide campus security access: (216) 397-4294

~~(32) A committee modeled after the Bushnell Advisory Committee shall be formed by the residents to meet with John Carroll University representatives during construction.~~